



UNIVERSIDADE D
COIMBRA



Marta Filipa Soares Vieira

Organizational Interventions that promote Positive Leaderships

Dissertação no âmbito do Mestrado de Psicologia das Organizações e do trabalho
orientada pela Professora Doutora Leonor Maria Gonçalves Pacheco Pais e
apresentada à Faculdade de Psicologia e Ciências da Educação da Universidade de
Coimbra

Fevereiro de 2019

Agradecimentos:

A realização desta dissertação de mestrado contou com importantes apoios e incentivos, por esta razão gostaria de agradecer:

Ao professor Nuno, acima de tudo pela sua simpatia, orientação e paciência. Gostaria de agradecer também pelo seu rigor e disponibilidade, e pela sua exigência e espírito crítico.

À professora Leonor, igualmente pela sua orientação e disponibilidade, mas também pela sua motivação e simpatia. Aprendi bastante com a forma prática e focada com que aborda cada assunto.

Aos meus colegas de investigação. Ao Álvaro pela sua disponibilidade e pelas suas dicas úteis. À Mariana Moreno e Mariana Santos pelos momentos de partilha, entreaajuda e motivação.

Às minhas amigas e colegas, Sara, Daniela e Joana, que me acompanharam desde o primeiro ano da licenciatura. Pela vossa amizade, pelos conselhos, compreensão, tranquilidade e boa disposição. Um agradecimento especial à Joana por me ter apoiado e ajudado neste processo.

À Rita, ao Francisco e aos meus amigos de sempre, por estarem ao meu lado nesta fase e especialmente nos momentos difíceis, lembrando-me de que era capaz, pela vossa tranquilidade, paciência, companheirismo e por estarem presentes.

Aos meus pais e restante família, por me terem permitido tomar as minhas decisões e pelo apoio e incentivo que me deram, não só durante este período, mas durante todo o meu percurso académico.

Por todas as razões referidas anteriormente, a todos eles agradeço e dedico este trabalho!

Intervenções Organizacionais que promovem Lideranças Positivas

Resumo

Esta revisão sistemática da literatura caracteriza programas de intervenção em organizações que visam promover uma liderança positiva e ética. Nós fornecemos uma revisão de 18 artigos empíricos sobre liderança Autêntica, liderança Servidora e liderança Ética. Primeiro, realizamos uma conceptualização e um enquadramento da teoria da liderança Autêntica, Servidora e Ética. Em segundo lugar, descrevemos os métodos e apresentamos os resultados da análise. Utilizando palavras-chave como 'Liderança Servidora', 'Liderança Autêntica', 'Liderança Virtuosa' e 'Liderança Ética' no título, e 'programa' ou 'intervenção' no resumo, em bases de dados indexadas na EBSCO, e após a aplicação dos critérios de inclusão, 18 artigos foram revisados. Os resultados mostram que o modelo mais frequente na literatura é a liderança Autêntica, e que a maioria dos artigos empíricos analisou amostras de estudantes e gestores / líderes, utilizando principalmente questionários. Relativamente ao modelo de Liderança Servidora, destacaram-se três características dos líderes servidores, como a consciencialização, o compromisso com o crescimento dos outros e a construção da comunidade. No que se refere ao modelo de Liderança Autêntica, os conceitos de autoconsciência, perspetiva moral internalizada e transparência relacional mostraram-se extremamente importantes e, por fim, verificou-se uma forte correlação entre traços de personalidade e a liderança Ética. Finalmente, concluímos com a discussão dos resultados, limitações do artigo, futuras investigações e implicações práticas do artigo, para expandir esta área de intervenção, alcançando novos avanços teóricos e empíricos.

Palavras-Chave: Revisão sistemática da literatura; Liderança positiva; Intervenção; Liderança Autêntica; Liderança Servidora; Liderança Ética.

Organizational Interventions that promote Positive Leaderships

Abstract

This systematic literature review characterizes intervention programs in organizations aimed at promoting positive and ethical-related leadership. We provide a review of 18 empirical articles on Authentic leadership, Servant leadership, and Ethical leadership. First, we present a conceptual clarity and framework of Authentic, Servant and Ethical leadership theories. Second, we describe the methods and present the results of the analysis. Using the key-words 'Servant leadership', 'Authentic leadership', 'Virtuous leadership' and 'Ethical leadership' in Title, and 'program' or 'intervention' in Abstract in databases indexed in EBSCO, and after applying the inclusion criteria 18 articles were reviewed. The results show that the most frequent model in literature is the Authentic leadership and that most of the empiric articles analyzed samples of students and managers/business leaders, using mainly questionnaires. Relatively to the Servant Leadership model, three characteristics of servant leaders such as awareness, commitment to the growth of others and building community stood out. Concerning the Authentic Leadership model, the concepts of self-awareness, internalized moral perspective, and relational transparency proved to be extremely important, and, lastly, it was verified a strong correlation between personality traits and Ethical leadership. We finally conclude by discussing the results, limitations of the article, future research, and practical implications, to bring this field of intervention forward reaching theoretical and empirical advancement.

Keywords: Systematic literature review; Positive leadership; Intervention; Authentic leadership; Servant leadership; Ethical leadership.

Index

Introduction.....1

Method.....6

Results.....7

Discussion.....42

References.....47

Introduction

The purpose of this article is to characterize intervention programs in organizations aimed at promoting positive leadership, focusing exclusively on ethics, through a systematic literature review of articles reporting empirical research on those interventions.

Leadership is one of the most researched social influence processes in the behavioral sciences, due to its association with successful economic, political, and organizational systems (Parris & Peachey, 2012). There is no single leadership definition accepted by all. However, is generally considered that leadership involves persuasion and influencing other people to pursue a common goal that is considered important or relevant (Pfeiffer & Wechsler, 2013). With the advent of people-oriented management style in today's competitive business world, leadership styles begin to change day by day (Yiğit & Bozkurt, 2017). According to some authors, leadership should not be viewed as domination, it requires creating a shared vision, building trust and confidence in others, and enabling others to act toward a common goal (Pfeiffer & Wechsler, 2013).

Leadership theories attempt to explain and organize the complexity of the nature of related phenomenon including its consequences (Parris & Peachey, 2012). Different theories were developed over time, some of which proposed three situational dimensions influence the leader's effectiveness (such as leader-member relations and task complexity/ structure) and was later extended, suggesting that adaptability is a concept of great importance. Other models emphasized that leadership is a process rather than a personality trait and the situation shapes how leaders behave. The role of the environment is crucial and leadership styles might be more facilitative in certain settings than others, or more valued according to specific goals defined by the group (Pfeiffer & Wechsler, 2013). Great leaders create a vision for an organization, articulate the vision to the followers, build a shared vision, craft a path to achieve the vision, and guide their organizations into new directions (Parris & Peachey, 2012).

As the article focuses on intervention programs in organizations that promote positive leadership, three models of leadership will be presented, focusing only on ethics. The three models presented are Authentic leadership, Servant leadership, and Ethical leadership. For this reason, other leadership models, such as transformational

leadership, which focuses not only on ethics but also on dimensions related to effectiveness and innovation processes, will not be considered in this systematic literature review.

Regarding ethical aspects, the leadership of any organization is based on the strong character of the individuals running it (Mostaza, Narbarte, Gayoba, Borromeo & Balila, 2018). The word ethics comes from the Greek *ethos* which means character or custom and the focus is agent-centric because it explains how to become a virtuous person (Bauman, 2018). Ethical issues are present in many activities that take place in the day-to-day, with different people involved (Rasera, Oliveira & Jesus, 2014). Leaders serve as the organization's conscience as they set the moral tone that spreads from the top to the lowest level of the organizational hierarchy. Ethical leadership can be defined as the demonstration of normatively appropriate conduct through personal actions and interpersonal relationships, and the promotion of such conduct to followers through two-way communication, reinforcement, and decision-making (Mostaza et al., 2018).

Over the past decade, governmental and business leaders have struggled to earn the commitment of followers and the support of society and trust in leaders has dropped in both public and private sector organizations. In the highly competitive twenty-first century world of business, virtuousness is rarely emphasized in most organizations as firms struggle to compete for customers and profits (Caldwel, Hasan & Smith, 2015). Knowledge plays a critical part in how leaders persuade people and virtue requires knowledge (Bauman, 2018). Historically, virtuousness has its roots in Aristotelian ethics and includes the desire to achieve personal and social ideals and instrumental outcomes (Caldwel et al., 2015).

A virtuous person has the knowledge required for virtue and knows what is good and understand its limitations (Bauman, 2018). Scholars often have viewed virtuousness in terms of character strengths, and so a potential leader develops these characteristics through proper teaching about what is true through math, science, and dialogue (Caldwel et al., 2015; Bauman, 2018). The goal of ethical stewardship is to create a transformative relationship in organizations that enables it to increase profitability, productivity, quality, and excellence while building commitment and trust (Caldwel et al., 2015).

The virtuous leader views the organization as not only responsible for creating value but for creating a better world, including the obligation to leave a legacy for future generations. Virtues are widely acknowledged mindsets, character traits, and dispositions that are a key foundation of ethical relationships and that implicitly includes moral duties owed to others. Six virtues are linked to outstanding leaders such as character, competence commitment, courage, clarity, and compassion. Each of these virtuous leadership qualities requires translating that specific virtue into a leadership action that demonstrates the leader's commitment to action. Similarly, those who are led expect to be treated with dignity and respect as valued organizational partners (Caldwel et al., 2015).

Traditional approaches to organization and management usually consolidate power in the hands of a few individuals and expect compliance from rank and file employees (Winston & Fields, 2015). Servant leadership emphasizes a leader's facilitation of follower performance and development which can occur directly through leader mentoring, engaging followers in training, or indirectly by providing support and concern as well as an ethical and transparent working environment (Winston & Fields, 2015). This person-oriented attitude exhibited creates safe and strong relationships within an organization since servant leaders focus on the well-being of the employees (Winston & Fields, 2015). Although there is still little consensus about the definition of servant leadership or the mechanisms by which it works (Parris & Peachey, 2012; Winston & Fields, 2015). Servant leadership theory predicts that organizational leaders who use a particular set of leadership behaviors will impact employee perceptions and subsequent actions through the process of social exchange. Servant leadership is initiated by the behaviors of a leader and is transmitted by followers reciprocating the leader behaviors (Winston & Fields, 2015).

The term "servant leadership" was introduced by Robert Greenleaf in his seminar work "The Servant Leader", first published in 1970 (Rachmawati & Lantu, 2014). According to Greenleaf, the servant-leader tries to serve to his followers first and this starts with his natural feeling of wanting to serve. There is a large consensus in the literature that servant-leaders focus on serving their followers and think firstly about them. According to Spears, servant-leaders respect and involve their followers in decision making and planning processes (Yiğit & Bozkurt, 2017). The most important

in the decision-making process are mutually acceptable decision through good understanding and the maturity of followers. Servant leadership focuses on stability and evolutionary of the organization by the follower's personal growth as the foundation (Rachmawati & Lantu, 2014). Greenleaf outlined ten characteristics of servant leaders such as listening, empathy, healing, awareness, persuasion, conceptualization, foresight, stewardship, commitment to the growth of others and building community (Fields, Thompson & Hawkins, 2015).

Servant leadership theory emphasizes the responsibility of an organizational leader to encourage the development of autonomy and responsibility of followers. Most of the research to date on servant leadership consists of developing theoretical frameworks and establishing measurement tools with the intention that future scholars can apply these tools to explore servant leadership in practice and as theory (Parris & Peachey, 2012). Previous studies have found that servant leadership behaviors predict employee organizational citizenship behaviors through increased commitment to the supervisor and higher employee self-efficacy. Other studies have linked servant leadership positively with the satisfaction of followers' psychological needs, promotion focus, job satisfaction, empowerment, organizational commitment, and creative behaviors. However, other research suggests that managers with a high need for power are more effective (Winston & Fields, 2014). Knowing the determinants of servant leadership is so important as it is to know its consequences. Moreover, knowing the several intervention programs designed to develop servant leadership allows us to understand it better and to apply effective strategies to spread it within organizations. The challenge is now for researchers to use more robust methods to test how servant leadership differs empirically from the other leadership theories, to predict validity over existing leadership theories and understand if the different focus of leadership theories influences the paths by which they predict outcomes (Eva, Robin, Sendjaya, Van Dierendonck & Liden, 2018).

Both Servant leadership and Authentic leadership acknowledge the importance of being authentic and true in one's interaction with others (Avolio & Gardner, 2005). New challenges derivatives of technologies, market demands, and competition arises, which have precipitated a renewed focus on leaders with purpose, values, and integrity (Avolio & Gardner, 2005). Considering the concept of authentic leadership, it is necessary to,

firstly, define authenticity, which can be described as the unobstructed operation of one's true, or core, self in one's daily enterprise. The word itself *authentēs* or *authento* translates into variations around the theme of being self-made, reflecting the definition given to it by various philosophers (Fusco, O'Riordan & Palmer, 2015).

Some of the first applications of the construct of authenticity to leadership emerged within the fields of sociology and education (Avolio & Gardner, 2005). This implicates that authentic leaders know oneself and act in accordance with one's true self by expressing what they really think and behave accordingly. Authentic leaders are people that make difficult decisions based on core values and high standards of ethical conduct. Hence, authentic leaders lead as an expression of their true and real self and merge moral principles with their leadership practice. Individual moral behavior and possibly authentic leadership are the partial results of four distinct but interlinked intra-psychological competencies (ability to perceive moral challenges, mature moral justice reasoning, intrinsic motivation to act morally and ability to implement moral decisions) (Olsen & Espevik, 2017). Each of these components must be activated for moral action to occur and may be an operationalization of moral intelligence, which represents an individuals' capacity to process and manage moral problems (Olsen & Espevik, 2017).

Hence, high scores on these four moral competencies suggest increased likeliness that a leader behaves morally, even under pressure to deviate from moral standards (Olsen & Espevik, 2017). Authentic leaders are also posited to draw from the positive psychological states that accompany optimal self-esteem and psychological well-being, such as confidence, optimism, hope, and resilience, to model and promote the development of these states in others. Moreover, they apply a positive moral perspective to lead by example as they communicate through their words and deeds high moral standards and values (Gardner, Avolio, Luthans, May & Walumbwa, 2005).

Authentic leaders can be seen as those who bring people together around shared values and mutual respect that empowers everyone. Avolio and Gardner (2005) define authentic leaders as those who are deeply aware of how they think and behave and are perceived by others as being aware of their own and others' values/moral perspectives, knowledge, and strengths; aware of the context in which they operate; and who are confident, hopeful, optimistic, resilient, and of high moral character. Despite the expanding literature, the theory is still in the process of maturation and the definition is

not precisely clear. Originally conceived to promote more ethical and democratic leadership in business, authentic leadership has been increasingly applied to the field of education (Greenier & Whitehead, 2016). The conceptualization of authentic leadership includes four individual components: self-awareness, internalized moral perspective, relational transparency and balanced processing (Fusco, O’Riordan & Palmer, 2016).

Although still recent, there is evidence demonstrating the potential value of authentic leadership to groups and organizations in terms of employee engagement, satisfaction, performance, and wellbeing. Studies found that authentic leadership positively affects group performance. Other studies found that authentic leadership increases role performance and team effectiveness. In addition, there is also research supporting the link between authentic leadership and work engagement and satisfaction. The emerging evidence is starting to demonstrate a connection between authentic leadership and a broad range of organizational benefits and positive organizational citizenship behaviors (Fusco et al., 2016).

Thus, we expect that this article allows researchers and practitioners to deepen their understanding of leadership phenomenon by taking stock of what has been studied and explored on the subject. Moreover, we expect to contribute to the improvement of practical solutions concerning leadership quality whether in organizational or political realms. Specifically, we will describe what has been studied, in which populations through which methods and what findings have been reached. Finally, we will identify the gaps in the research and will suggest future research avenues.

Method

The search expression includes the key-words ‘Servant leadership’, ‘Authentic leadership’, ‘Virtuous leadership’ and ‘Ethical leadership’ in Title, and ‘development’ or ‘program’ or ‘intervention’ in Abstract. In all the combined pairs the condition ‘psychology’ in All text was added as a way of excluding those articles that were far from that discipline. The search was performed, on 25/10/18. in the following databases: Complementary Index, Ultimate Business Source, Academic Search Ultimate, Regional Business News, ScienceDirect, SocINDEX with Full Text, eBook Collection (EBSCOhost), Supplemental Index, Social Sciences Citation Index , ERIC, Criminal Justice Abstracts with Full Text, Science Citation Index, JSTOR Journals,

Library, Information Science & Technology Abstracts, Persée, Research Starters, RCAAP, IEEE Xplore Digital Library, SciELO, PsycARTICLES, OAPEN Library, SOAR - Social Science Open Access Repository, Integrated Catalog of Libraries of the University of Coimbra, arXiv, Cairn.info and CogPrints. All were included in the EDS-EBSCO Discovery service. The inclusion criteria were: a) scientific articles reviewed by experts, (b) written in English and (c) published in academic journals. The articles that were retrieved were subject to title and abstract reading for the final decision of inclusion or exclusion, considering we were interested in interventions for improving those types of leadership. Interventions that target output through those leadership models, as well as those that focus on their impact, were excluded. The articles that reported the development of a measure or instrument were also excluded.

Results

After applying the inclusion and exclusion criteria, eighteen articles were retained for analysis. Considering that our purpose is to characterize intervention program promoting positive leadership, centered exclusively on ethics, such as authentic, servant and ethical leadership, our strategy to analyze was focused on descriptive aspects of the interventions: samples, objectives, independent and dependent variables, measures used, research design, main findings, limitations and suggestions for future research. As shown in Table 1, sample dimension ranges from 3 to 443 targeting principals, teachers, workers, managers and management students, and leaders from Canada, USA, Pakistan, Norway, Philippines, Netherland, England, and Malaysia. Most of the studies analyzed samples of students, which represents 27% of the articles analyzed, and managers/business leaders, which represents 33% of the analyzed articles. Authentic leadership was used in eight interventions, Servant leadership in six and ethical leadership was used in four interventions. The table is organized by models and in chronological order, that is, from the oldest to the most recent study.

Table 1. Samples, focus and main findings of the studies

Model: Authentic Leadership			
Reference	n	Description	Main goal and Main findings
Opatokun, Hasim & Hassan, 2013	214	Academic, management	Main goal: to test if self-awareness, balanced processing of information,

		and professional administrative staff members	internalized moral perspective, and relational transparency are predictors of authentic leadership among administrative heads at International Islamic University (IIUM). Main findings: the four predictors explained authentic leadership. The tested model provides empirical evidence about the pattern of authentic leadership in higher education, confirming the presence of authentic leadership in organizations. Staff rates the authentic leadership of administrative heads as moderately high on all the dimensions of Authentic Leadership. Self-awareness constitutes the core component of authentic leadership and its development may be an influence on the development of different patterns of authentic leadership, as an antecedent variable. When administrative heads hold high levels of such self-awareness, they may be much more likely to develop the authenticity of their colleagues in efforts to improve higher learning. Internalized moral perspective is a required component of authentic leadership.
Fusco, O’Riordan & Palmer, 2015	21	Senior leaders from within private and public organizations	Main goal: to develop a theory of group coaching and build this into a conceptual and evidence-based method of Authentic Leadership Development (ALD). Main findings: a model was developed comprising four core concepts of authentic leadership along with seven sub-categories of key leadership skills. The reflective logs showed the social structure of the group was a positive thing as illustrated by emerging codes such as positive anticipation and the witnessing of self and others. Authentic Self-Development is a necessary precursor or an integral element of Authentic Leadership Development. The authors proposed a further level of abstraction to four core concepts (a competent leader, a confident leader, a conscious leader, and a congruent leader), supporting the idea that insights, skills, and solutions reside in the individual and it is a case of helping them access these resources.

Baron, 2016	93	French-Canadian middle managers	Main goal: to determine whether a leadership development program based on action learning principles could foster the development of AL (Authentic leadership). Main findings: mindfulness was positively associated with AL. There was a significant effect of time on AL and mindfulness assessment. Participants scored significantly higher on AL and mindfulness after completing the first year. Self-assessed perceptions of AL increased over time among participants.
Fusco, O’Riordan & Palmer, 2016	25	Senior leaders in organizations (representing roles such as CEO, Director, Assistant Director, Heads of Profession and Senior Managers)	Main goal: to design and evaluate a leadership development intervention with the specific objective of developing authentic leadership. This study reports on the efficacy of authentic leadership group-coaching. Main findings: it was concluded that the relatively short-term Authentic Leadership coaching group is an effective form of Authentic Leadership Development. The results support the hypothesis that leadership coaching-groups are an effective form of authentic leadership development. Self-Awareness, moral perspective, and relational transparency showed significance.
Greenier & Whitehead, 2016	56	Native-speaking English teachers	Main goal: to investigate how the model of Authentic Leadership applies to language teaching and its implications for future directions in teacher education programs. Main findings: the data suggest a need for teachers to be cognitively aware of their own practices and characteristics that enhance learning as well as inhibit it. Teachers are also role models of the teaching profession itself, so they must do their job demonstrating positive values, moral integrity, and high-ethical standards. A model for teacher leadership built upon the principles of Authentic Leadership will provide teachers with a frame to better understand and apply their knowledge, experiences, and passion for teaching.
Evans, Hess, Abdelhamid & Stepleman, 2017	51	College students	Main goal: a low-cost leadership development program (the Authentic Leadership Pipeline program) was initiated and developed to meet the leadership needs

			<p>of the consolidation of Georgia Health Sciences University and Augusta State University. The program was divided into Pipeline I (focused on leading self) and Pipeline II (focused on leading others). Main findings: results indicated that effective leadership development is linked to institutional culture. The high likelihood of recommending the program to a colleague suggests that the program has the potential to generate leadership behavior change. For Pipeline I, participants appear to have grown in two areas of authentic leadership (self-awareness and balanced processing) and in two areas of self-leadership (task motivation and constructive cognition). For Pipeline II, the participants gained a better understanding of organizational change and expanded their understanding of influence as a leadership tactic to include a variety of styles and strategies.</p>
Olsen & Espevik, 2017	139	Norwegian naval officer cadets	<p>Main goal: to explore intra-psychological moral processes as potential antecedents of authentic leadership (AL) behavior and add to knowledge about underlying moral processes involved in authentic leadership. Main findings: mature moral reasoning and moral motivation represent important aims for leader development among emergency leaders. There is a direct relationship between mature moral reasoning (PCS activation) and Authentic Leadership, on all dimensions, what indicates that a moral challenge is embedded in all the dimensions of AL and it is not exclusively the property of the internalized moral perspective dimension. Authentic Leadership is the result of both a genuine internalized moral orientation and an ability to promote these values openly. Psychological hardiness as operationalization of moral implementation competency had no impact on Authentic Leadership. High levels of principled moral reasoning lead to a strong sense of moral duty, which bridges a gap between moral reasoning and behavior.</p>

Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017	97	Leaders working in business	Main goal: to investigate the impact of leaders' wilderness experiences on intentions to transform leadership behaviors toward authentic leadership. The present research was conducted amongst participants of the Wilderness Leadership Transformation Program of the Foundation for Natural Leadership (FNL), based in the Netherlands. Main findings: the analyses revealed four categories of leaders' peak experiences (a heightened sense of self, awareness of one's core values, deep connected attention, and being in full presence). Participants also experienced the inner balance of sharp sensory awareness connected with a profound feeling like coming home. The analysis of the data revealed four types of intentions: to be more aware of self, live by the inner compass, improve careful listening, and become more transparent. The study suggests that being immersed in nature can act as a significant life event that has the potential to foster authentic leadership.
Model: Servant Leadership			
Reference	n	Description	Main goal and Main findings
Taylor, Martin, Hutchinson & Jinks, 2007	362	Principals and teachers	Main goal: to examine the leadership practices of principals identified as servant leaders. Main findings: the principals who rated themselves at 145 or lower were identified as non-servant leaders and the principals who rated themselves at 146 or higher were identified as servant leaders. The examination of the differences between servant leaders and non-servant leaders revealed a significant difference between the two groups of principals and how teachers perceived them. Public school principals who rated themselves high in terms of their perception of their use of the characteristics of servant leadership were also rated significantly higher by their teachers. Servant leaders are perceived by their teachers as more effective leaders in the areas of challenging the process, inspiring a shared vision, enabling others to act, modelling the way and encouraging the heart. When the scores of the school leaders

			<p>were compared with the normative data both labelled servant leaders and those who were below the median split, scored higher for all leadership practices. Both groups of school leaders were rated higher for enabling others than the business managers norm group. Inspiring a shared vision was lowest rated for both the servant leader and non-servant leader groups. The behaviors most valued by followers are modelling the way, enabling others and encouraging the heart. The Authentic Leadership and mindfulness scores of the third cohort tended to decrease before clearly increasing in the subsequent years.</p>
<p><i>Ebener & O'Connell, 2010</i></p>	3	<p>Catholic parishes in southeast Iowa (pastors and parishes staff)</p>	<p>Main goal: to examine the mechanics of servant leadership, particularly how it enhances organizational citizenship and how that drives organizational effectiveness. A model is presented showing possible linkages between servant leadership behavior and organizational citizenship behavior. Main findings: three direct leadership mechanisms were identified (invitation, inspiration, and affection). Leaders influence the behaviors of followers even when they were not present or when they had no direct contact with the follower. Two organizational leadership mechanisms through servant leaders fostered organizational citizenship were identified (culture building and structural initiatives).</p>
<p>Massey, Sulak & Sriram, 2013</p>	32	<p>Students</p>	<p>Main goal: to examine the integration of servant leadership and experiential learning in the development of student leaders participating in extended orientation programs. The focus of the experience shifted from the development of student leaders to the transition of the new students they were serving. Main findings: compared to leadership education in the classroom, leadership development is limited by experiences that do not include intentional reflection. The impact of informal reflection during and after the experiential component reinforces both the need and the potential for additional formal</p>

			reflection that helps students make links between the classroom learning and the practical experience. The most significant growth in student leader development occurred when the most intentional educational interventions were present. For these programs to be most effective, program design must include intentional instruction at each phase of the learning cycle.
Stewart, 2014	160	Students	Main goal: to determine how undergraduate teacher education students' participation in service-learning activities would affect their TSE (teacher sense of efficacy) and sense of servant leadership. Main findings: findings revealed that service-learners increased significantly in each sub-scale of the TSE. Service-learners who were challenged to develop their own projects or to take responsible roles in and control over meaningful activities have reported an increased sense of efficacy. The encouragement received from the college instructor and peers was likely perceived as an emotionally positive influence for the pre-internship students. The structure and processes of the service-learning project support the noted increase in TSE.
Fields, Thompson & Hawkins, 2015	46	students	Main goal: the study of servant leadership was infused into an undergraduate senior capstone experience (an internship) for emerging helping professionals (social work and child and family studies majors). Main findings: analysis of student reflections revealed an internalization of servant leadership principles and an understanding of their application within a professional context. Field supervisor evaluations of students indicated professional development consistent with servant leadership ideals. It was observed an increase in empowering and developing others and in serving others and also an increase of awareness of responsibility toward others and building strong relationships and communities.
Winston & Fields, 2015	443	Working adults	Main goal: to clarify the nature of how servant leadership is established and

			transmitted among members of an organization and identify and evaluate the unique actions by a leader essential to establishing servant leadership. Main findings: ten leader behaviors that seem to be essential to servant leadership were identified and validated (practice what it is preached; serve people without regard to their nationality, gender, or race; See serving as a mission of responsibility to others; genuinely interest in employees as people; understand that serving others is important; be willing to make sacrifices to help others; seek to instill trust rather than fear or insecurity; be honest; be driven by a sense of higher calling and promote values that transcend self-interest and material success). Eight of the ten items describe actions that may build trust between a leader and subordinates and facilitate a cooperative and achievement oriented working relationship. The willingness of a servant leader to serve the needs of subordinates and demonstrate honesty on a regular basis is sufficiently stimulating so that subordinates exert extra efforts toward success.
Model: Ethical Leadership			
Reference	n	Description	Main goal and Main findings
Kvalnes & Øverenget, 2012	Not available	Business leaders and managers	Main goal: to strengthen the abilities of leaders and managers to handle dilemmas in their professional activities and to voice their own moral viewpoints and considerations. The core element is The Navigation Wheel, a figure used to keep track of relevant decision factors. Main findings: feedback from former participants suggests widespread use of the Navigation Wheel in organizations which have invested in dilemma training as a central element in the development of their employees. Feedback from participants indicates that dilemma training has helped them to recognize the ethical dimension of leadership. By using the Navigation Wheel to analyze a situation in advance, they can increase their ability to spot possible situations of dilemma that might occur with

			a given choice.
Gentile,2015	Not available	Students	Main goal: an innovative approach to values-driven leadership called “Giving Voice to Values” (GVV) was developed as a response to the challenge of transforming management education’s approach to ethics in the curriculum. Main findings: The Giving Voice to Values methodology is robust and flexible across a variety of contexts: academic and extracurricular, athletics, different age and academic levels, cultural and geographic diversity. The GVV can be adapted for a variety of leadership challenges and opportunities.
Ullah, Rehman, Hameed & Kayani, 2017	357	Pakistan manufacturing organizations	Main goal: to examine the relationship between ethical leadership and corporate social responsibility (CSR) by concentrating on the mediating role of the intellectual capital and ethical culture of the organization. Main findings: this study concludes that ethical leadership positively affects CSR and discovers the presence of ethical culture, social capital, and human capital as a mediator in the relationship between ethical leadership and CSR. Social capital and human capital have a positive and significant impact on CSR. Ethical leadership increases organizational ethical culture. Ethical leadership is positively associated with social capital and human capital. Organization ethical culture is significantly and positively associated with CSR. Human capital mediates the relation between ethical leadership and CSR. A direct association was observed between ethical leadership and CSR. An indirect relationship was found between ethical leadership and CSR through ethical culture and intellectual capital.
Mostaza, Narbarte, Gayoba, Borrromeo & Balila, 2018	265	Administrators from 27 Christian institutions in the Philippines	Main goal: to determine the mediating effect of personality traits on religiosity and ethical leadership as a basis for a leadership program. Main findings: personality traits fully mediate religiosity and ethical leadership. Agreeableness, openness to experience, and conscientiousness predict ethical leadership. Religiosity does not directly predict a leader’s predisposition to

			demonstrate and promote ethical conduct. A Leadership Development Program was developed with the aim of improving the personality traits of the leader, which influence his consistent behavior patterns, revealing that transformation of character is where leadership development begins.
--	--	--	--

Considering the results of the different studies, it can be highlighted the importance of the concepts of self-awareness, internalized moral perspective and relational transparency, which were commonly present in the results of different articles, and were positively correlated with transform leadership behavior toward authentic leadership and leadership development (Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017; Fusco et al., 2016). Results also show that contact with nature enhances authentic leadership (Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017).

In a general way, the variety of articles analyzed reach different conclusions. Findings revealed that service-learners who were challenged to develop their own projects or to take responsible roles in and control over meaningful activities have reported an increased sense of efficacy. It should also be noted that the encouragement received from instructors and peers can be perceived as an emotionally positive influence (Stewart, 2014). Leaders influence the behaviors of followers whether or not they are present or even when they had no direct contact with the follower, which can originate two mechanisms -structural initiatives and cultural building, contributing to perceive organizational effectiveness (*Ebener & O'Connell, 2010*). It is also relevant to mention that internalizing traits of servant leaders is useful in helping professions, which is verified with an increased awareness of responsibility toward others and building strong relationships with the communities (Fields et al., 2015).

Related now to a based authentic leadership principles model for teachers, this will provide a framework for a better understanding of the students and their knowledge and experiences (Greenier & Whitehead, 2016). The results demonstrate that there is, in fact, a direct relationship between moral reasoning and authentic leadership (Olsen & Espevik, 2017). I also consider relevant to refer that Mindfulness was positively correlated with authentic leadership, having a significant effect on it (Baron, 2016).

Finally, coaching groups have proven to be an effective form of leadership development (Fusco et al., 2016).

Regarding ethical leadership, it should be noted that dilemma training sessions help to recognize the ethical dimensions of leadership, with the navigation wheel helping participants, and that the effects that religiosity has on ethical leadership demonstrates a strong correlation between personality traits and ethical leadership (Kvalnes & Øverenget, 2012; Mostaza et al., 2018). Ethical leadership is also positively associated with social and human capital and corporate social responsibility, which is positively correlated with organizational ethical culture (Ullah et al., 2017). The next table (table 2) refers to the nuclear construct, in this case, types of leadership, since this review focus on interventions that aim for positive and ethical-related leadership in organizations and focuses on the measurement and independent variables associated with the different studies. The table is organized by models and in chronological order, that is, from the oldest to the most recent study.

Table 2. Measures and independent variables

Model: Authentic Leadership		
Reference	Dependent variables (and measurement)	Independent variables
Opatokun, Hasim & Hassan, 2013	Authentic leadership (Authentic leadership questionnaire (ALQ))	Self-awareness, balanced processing of information, internalized moral perspective, relational transparency (Data was collected from administrative staff of International Islamic University Malaysia, participants were asked to rate the authentic leadership of their administrative heads using the ALQ)
Fusco, O’Riordan & Palmer, 2015	Authentic leadership development (ALD) (coaching groups, semi-structured interviews)	Group-coaching program (4 authentic leadership coaching groups were conducted over an 18-month period, each group consisted of five or six senior leaders, run once a month over 3 months)
Baron, 2016	Authentic leadership development and Mindfulness (Authentic Leadership questionnaire (ALQ), The Mindful Attention Awareness	Action learning principles (Training program, collective sessions, 3 years, 15 days each year, five consecutive days every

	scale, Semi-structured interviews, comparison group)	four months, for a total of 45 days of training)
Fusco, O’Riordan & Palmer,2016	Authentic leadership development (ALD) (coaching groups, Authentic leadership questionnaire (ALQ), Authentic leadership inventory (ALI))	Group-coaching interventions (Five 3-month long group-coaching interventions run over a period of two years)
Greenier & Whitehead,2016	Authentic leadership (online survey)	ELT (English Language Teaching)
Evans et al.,2017	Authentic leadership (questionnaire)	Authentic Leadership Pipeline program (examines reactions and subjective perceptions of learning and behavior Self-awareness and balanced processing, self-efficacy). (Classes met twice a month on successive Fridays and Saturdays for each module over the course of 2 months for a total of eight meetings. Each meeting was 3 hours)
Olsen & Espevik, 2017	Authentic leadership (ALQ, the defining issues Test 2 (DIT 2), SIMI (self-importance of Moral identity inventory), Dispositional resiliency scale)	Intra-psychological moral processes - moral justice reasoning, self-importance of moral identity and psychological hardiness. (9 months of leadership training, including 11-week exercise sailing across the Atlantic, two weeks’ winter training and two weeks’ military ranger training; during these exercises, the cadets systematically rotated in filling all leadership positions)
Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017	Authentic leadership (reports)	Wilderness Leadership Transformation Program (four- to six-day, wilderness trail with a group of five to seven participants, completed with one or two local guides and a certified facilitator)
Model: Servant Leadership		
Reference	Dependent variables (and measurement)	Independent variables
Taylor, Martin, Hutchinson & Jinks, 2007	Servant leadership (self-assessment for leadership profile (SASLP); Leadership Practices inventory (LPI))	Leadership practices of principals identified as servant leaders (112 principals completed the SASLP survey, principals, then three teachers from each of the

		principal's schools were randomly selected to complete the LPI and asked to assess their principals' effectiveness)
<i>Ebener & O'Connell, 2010</i>	Servant leadership mechanisms (direct observation, focus group, interviews)	Organizational citizenship and effectiveness (Evaluated from the analysis of the interactions between leaders and members of the parishes, and also from one-on-one interviews to parish leaders, led focus groups of council members and lay leaders, and observed religious services and meetings. The focus groups and one-on-one interviews were taped)
Massey, Sulak & Sriram, 2013	Servant leadership (survey)	Student leadership development - theoretical knowledge, leadership style, competence, interpersonal skills (All student leaders were required to register and pass a leadership development course prior to their summer leadership experience; after completion of the course, students served as leaders during an extended summer orientation program; duration not specified)
Stewart, 2014	Servant leadership (TSE (Teacher sense of efficacy scale), SLQ (Servant leader questionnaire))	Teacher sense of efficacy (focused on Student engagement, instructional strategies, classroom management), Servant leadership (focused on altruistic calling, emotional healing, wisdom, persuasive mapping, organizational stewardship) (Students enrolled in a course named 'Teaching Students with Disabilities in the General Education Classroom'; as complement students completed 15 hours of service learning through direct and personal experience with persons with disabilities; it was required to complete online modules comprising video-based tutorials before engaging in service-

		learning project)
Fields, Thompson & Hawkins, 2015	Servant leadership (weekly seminar, written reflections, field supervisor assessments, Servant Leadership Profile Revised- for self-evaluation (SLP-R))	Student Self-Reflection, Self-evaluation of Leadership Traits (3 years, weekly seminar sessions, students carried out an internship in a variety of agencies and organizations)
Winston & Fields, 2015	Servant leadership (questionnaire)	Transformational leadership behaviors, transactional leader behaviors, leadership effectiveness (A questionnaire was placed in internet-based survey software and the link provided to students and faculty at a private mid-Atlantic university and to university alumni and colleagues in a variety of organizations; respondents were asked to describe a leader with whom they worked for in the past five years and to include a specification of the job role)
Model: Ethical Leadership		
Reference	Dependent variables (and measurement)	Independent variables
Kvalnes & Øverenget, 2012	Ethical Navigation (dilemmas)	Leadership training sessions (Dilemmas training sessions, variable duration, the core element is The Navigation Wheel, a figure used to keep track of relevant decision factors)
Gentile, 2015	Ethical leadership (frameworks, peer coaching)	“Giving Voice to values” approach- developed as a response to transforming management education’s approach to ethics in the curriculum; currently targets the way to transform values and behavior, with a focus upon preparation for action. (Exercise of a problem, work in teams to respond to the question and to craft their action plans and they share those approaches with the rest of the group engaging then in a peer coaching session, variable duration)
Ullah, Rehman,	Relationship between ethical	Ethical culture of the

Hameed & Kayani, 2017	leadership and corporate social responsibility (CSR) (questionnaire survey- scale of Brown et al. (2005); 9-item measure by Key (1999);17-item measurement by Turker (2009); intellectual capital scale by Youndt et al. (2004))	organization, intellectual capital (Data was collected through questionnaire survey from Pakistani manufacturing organizations, in order to measure ethical leadership, ethical culture of the organization, CSR and social and human capital)
Mostaza, Narbarte, Gayoba, Borromeo & Balila, 2018	Ethical leadership (questionnaire)	Religiosity, personality traits (A questionnaire was developed and validated to assess the administrator's personality traits, religiosity, and ethical leadership profile. Personal background information was also obtained)

Most of the empiric articles analyzed in the table refer to authentic and servant leadership, therefore 44% of articles have authentic leadership as their theme, 33% refers to servant leadership and only 22% refers to ethical leadership. Relatively to the measurement, the most common measure was the questionnaire/survey, and about 72% of the literature analyzed resorted to this method. Regarding the authentic leadership articles, most of the articles utilized the ALQ (Authentic leadership questionnaire) and the ALI (Authentic leadership inventory). However, the articles referring to servant leadership used questionnaires such as Servant Leadership Profile Revised- for self-evaluation (SLP-R), Servant leader questionnaire (SLQ), self-assessment for leadership profile (SASLP), Leadership Practices inventory (LPI) and the Teacher sense of efficacy scale (TSE). The ethical leadership articles resorted to dilemmas, questionnaires, frameworks and peer coaching. Besides questionnaires, the authentic leadership related articles also used the mindfulness scale, semi-structured interviews, comparison groups, reports, coaching groups, online surveys and the self-importance of Moral identity inventory (SIMI). The articles referent to servant leadership also used direct observation, focus group, interviews, seminars, and written reflections.

Firstly, the most common independent variables related to authentic leadership within this analysis were programs, such as the Action Learning Principles Program, the Authentic Leadership Pipeline Program, and the Wilderness Leadership Program, also group coaching sessions were also recurrent. Besides those mentioned before, other identified variables identified were: the ELT (English Language Teaching), intra-

psychological moral process, self-awareness, balanced processing of information, internalized moral perspective and relational transparency and project management (PM). Secondly, the variables associated with servant leadership were students' self-reflections, self-evaluation of leadership traits, organization citizenship and effectiveness, student leadership development, Teacher sense of efficacy (TSE), leadership practices of principles as servant leaders, transformational leadership behaviors and leadership effectiveness. Finally, ethical leadership articles were related to religiosity, personality traits, leadership training sessions, dilemmas, intellectual capital and ethical culture of the organization. The next table (table 3) refers to limitations, implications, and suggestions mentioned by the authors of the analyzed empiric studies. The table is organized by models and in chronological order, that is, from the oldest to the most recent study.

Table 3. Limitations and future suggestions mentioned in the studies

Model: Authentic Leadership			
Reference	Limitations	Implications	Future Suggestions
Opatokun, Hasim & Hassan, 2013	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -The sample is selected from The administrative staff of International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM) only, therefore care must be taken in generalizing these results to all administrative staff working in the Malaysian universities or higher institutions of learning due to the limitation of the sample size; -Quota sampling technique was used for data collection, which makes it difficult to manage financial, and time constraints; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -The practical implication of authentic leadership as contended is significant to the educational sector and other vital sectors of society; -The findings indicate that participants view their leaders as authentic leaders in IIUM, which supports authentic leadership theory and suggests that authentic leaders are present in a wide variety of organizations; -The findings show that authentic leaders exhibit high levels of self-awareness, as well as high levels of internalized moral perspective, relational transparency, and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -There is a need to have leaders that are authentic in their dealings and dispositions; -Authentic leadership theory is a response to the managerial and corporate meltdowns, which pushed a significant need for genuine leadership, characterized by self-concept, integrity, morality, self-regulation, transparent self, and an ability to better cope with fast-changing and turbulent organizational contexts; -Normative approaches to authentic leadership will need to find an avenue in which leaders and staff work together to share leadership in a

		<p>balanced processing of information, indicating that authentic leaders will potentially place organizational and followers' needs above their own needs and will pursue ethical practices that will benefit learning;</p> <p>-In turbulent decision-making periods, leaders will allow their individual values to align with organizational and professional values.</p> <p>-This study might provide a starting point for future research in the area of authentic leadership pattern,</p> <p>-By supporting each other in trustful, mutual, and positive ways, such an approach may lead to improving schools, and ultimately lead to student achievement;</p>	planned and aligned way;
Fusco, O'Riordan & Palmer, 2015	<p>-The use of sampling and generalizability;</p> <p>-The small group coaching it is not a suitable method of development for everyone;</p>	<p>-The research represents the first attempt at an evidenced based approach to Authentic Leadership Development, offering a model, a method and an explanatory theory, besides it also represents a valuable contribution to both the field of leadership coaching and group coaching;</p> <p>-Through Grounded Theory the researchers were able to understand the group coaching process and develop</p>	<p>-Attempting a randomized control study, to assess the impact of an open group format versus an invite-only format in order to identify and understand the contra indicators to inclusion in a group and the impact these have;</p> <p>-Investigate any hierarchical relationship or mediating factors between the seven categories of performance improvement may help both individual leaders and sponsoring</p>

		<p>four overarching concepts of Authentic Leadership (conscious, competent, confident and congruent);</p> <p>-By introducing social theory, such as the concept of the social-self and the reflected-self, it is possible to understand how this new form of coaching is uniquely placed to develop Authentic Leadership;</p>	<p>organizations to make better informed decisions about participation;</p> <p>-The parallel process holds the key to the effectiveness of the group format, enabling the participants to work at both the intra and inter personal levels of experience, exploring and developing their self-concept in the social context that is unique to this form of coaching;</p>
Baron, 2016	<p>-Limited access to the leadership development program did not allow to follow more cohorts over the program;</p> <p>-A larger sample of participants who were surveyed six times would have enabled the use of randomized coefficients modeling to assess the trajectory of changes in AL between the measurement timepoints;</p> <p>-Only one training program was examined reducing the ability to generalize from the results;</p> <p>-It was not possible to determine which program components were the most effective due to the not differentiated effects of the various training practices specific to the professional development program examined in this study;</p>	<p>-This paper is the first to demonstrate that participation in a program of leadership development was associated with improved mindfulness;</p> <p>-Results suggest that a leadership development program based on action learning principles can foster the development of AL and mindfulness;</p> <p>-The core elements of action learning appear to be key to bringing about real changes in the behavior of participating managers and maximizing the chances of generating lasting effects;</p> <p>-Due to the leadership program similarities with programs based on acceptance and commitment therapy, the exercises in the program studied intended to foster a clarification of values, commitment to them</p>	<p>-The features of the leadership development program studied (such as its long duration, the sustained pace at which participants must engage in real projects in committees while triggering personal issues, the sustained frequency at which the participants receive and give feedback in small groups and to the community of participants and the peer coaching during and between the training sessions) “force” individuals to make contact with their true self;</p> <p>-Another group participating in a partial version of the program would allow differentiation of the effective program components.</p>

		and coherent action;	
Fusco, O'Riordan & Palmer, 2016	<p>-The sampling for this research involved purposive sampling;</p> <p>-The nature of the small group coaching process obliged the inclusion of participants who would work effectively, and quickly, within this format;</p> <p>-There are ethical issues that need to be considered if there are contra-indications of this being a suitable medium for particular individuals;</p> <p>-This form of Authentic Leadership Development may not be effective or applicable to the general leadership population, which will have implications for the generalizability of the findings and the practical application of the group format;</p> <p>-Both the ALQ and the ALI Were used only as a self-assessment tool;</p>	<p>-Group coaching would provide an effective vehicle for authentic leadership development, which is supported by the statistically significant increase in both the ALQ and the ALI scores;</p> <p>-Although this group intervention is undoubtedly not the only effective form of Authentic Leadership Development, the authors propose it is one of very few approaches to authentic leadership development that has been scientifically evaluated;</p> <p>-The results presented here offer a strong indication of the potential efficacy of authentic leadership group coaching and its ability to help participants develop as authentic leaders, in so doing it establishes a new, effective and evidenced-based method of authentic leadership development, representing a significant contribution to coaching science and leadership coaching practice;</p>	<p>-Peers and subordinates should be included in the 360-assessment process;</p> <p>-A longitudinal evaluation would help assess whether any of the reported changes are subject to atrophy, so an additional Time assessment may yield valuable additional data;</p>
Greenier & Whitehead, 2016	<p>-The scope of this study was rather limited, which conditioned the generalizability;</p>	<p>-The idea of leadership is vague and difficult to define when it comes to the ELT classroom;</p> <p>-The model of Authentic Leadership would lend itself well to</p>	<p>-Future research should analyze how language teachers working in their local context perceive leadership, which would be largely beneficial to understand what role</p>

		<p>the field as it already aligns with much of the existing literature in regard to positive teaching characteristics and practices, and it fits the current transition towards accounting for the web of social constructs embedded in teaching;</p> <p>-By incorporating the principles of Authentic Leadership in teacher-education programs, it will foster more direct cognitive awareness and reflection of leadership skills in classroom practice, and it will help teachers to better manage the unique challenges of being an EFL teacher;</p> <p>-Complementing degree and certificate programs with an unambiguous focus on how to be an effective and authentic leader in the classroom, will prepare teachers for the real-life challenges of on-the-job professional development, adapting to the local organization and cultural customs, and better handling communication difficulties;</p>	<p>Authentic Leadership may play in language teacher education around the world;</p> <p>-It would be beneficial to compare and correlate students' perceptions of their teachers' Authentic Leadership with teachers' self-evaluation, as has been the method for much of the Authentic Leadership research in other fields;</p>
Evans et al.,2017	<p>-The study relies on small sample size and subjective self-report data to measure reaction, subjective learning, and subjective behavior;</p> <p>-The self-report format is susceptible to participant</p>	<p>- The programs were grounded in the Authentic leadership model to bridge the cultural divide between the two consolidating entities, targeted toward middle management</p>	<p>- The results of the study should be investigated concurrently with objective measures of leadership success to determine the long-term impact of the learning and behavior changes</p>

	<p>distortion and the small sample size, regional differences, lack of underrepresented minorities and the use of a convenience sample may limit generalizability;</p> <p>-The lack of a comparison group weakens the ability to attribute the changes in learners' subjective learning to the participation in Pipeline I or II;</p> <p>-The timing of the post-course questionnaire, immediately after the last module, leaves unanswered the question of whether or not the course experience improved learning for the long-term or was simply a short-lived result of having just participated in a positive leadership development experience;</p>	<p>types, designed to develop authentic leadership skills to lead both self and others, and implemented to create a community of Augusta University and Augusta University Health System leaders;</p> <p>-The findings provide preliminary evidence that the Pipeline I and II programs were well received, met their objectives and were effective, and so it may serve as a useful model for leadership development programs conducted in a university consolidation environment;</p> <p>-The cost of investing in leadership development need not be high nor is it necessary to have a large staff to service the programmatic needs of large academic institutions;</p>	<p>associated with the Pipeline I and II programs;</p> <p>-The Pipeline programs continue as a new Women's Pipeline program initiative, and it may serve as a useful and scalable model for leadership development programs conducted in a university consolidation environment;</p>
Olsen & Espevik, 2017	<p>-The convenience sampling process and the relatively small sample of mainly male military cadets means that the findings may not apply to other organizations, or across gender;</p> <p>-Given that the study investigates the relationships between intra-psychological variables and AL, the negative effect may be rather limited in terms of generalizability;</p> <p>-Even though the participants are exposed</p>	<p>-The current sample, in terms of emergency workers, represent a large work population, supporting the practical relevance of the findings;</p> <p>-This study offers support for the idea that although moral behavior is often seen as a core value in itself, it is also intimately linked to the ability to perform authentic leadership behavior in military leaders;</p> <p>-By including measures</p>	Not Available

	<p>to each other as followers, peers, and leaders during a long and intense training period, it would be desirable for similar studies to include leaders outside training settings, from various organizational settings, to strengthen validity;</p>	<p>of moral reasoning, moral motivation, and psychological hardiness, this study elaborates and expands on previous investigations;</p> <p>-The investigation has demonstrated a stronger and more direct link between moral reasoning and Authentic Leadership than previous investigations;</p> <p>-By adding the four sub-dimensions of Authentic Leadership to the investigation, this contributes to a more nuanced understanding of the moral processes that support the various aspects of Authentic leadership;</p> <p>-The present study underscores the importance of nurturing mature moral reasoning and an internalized moral motivation, as well as an ability to display these moral values, which could represent a perspective in recruitment and selection processes, as part of the development of AL;</p>	
Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017	<p>-Actual changes in leadership style are not assessed and so it requires additional research;</p> <p>- The sample consists of leaders who have deliberately made the choice to invest in their personal growth and leadership development by participating on a</p>	<p>-The attributes of the transformation program that foster change as revealed here being in another world, facing unfamiliar challenges, peer-to-peer learning can be flexibly adopted and implemented in a wide range of leadership transformation</p>	<p>-The context of the study reflects an extreme form of transformation potential, with people being fully immersed in the wilderness for days. Hence, the potential for change does not necessarily translate to other, less extreme transformation</p>

	wilderness trail (developmental readiness), so findings cannot blindly be generalized to all leaders.	<p>programs.</p> <p>-Being immersed in nature can act as a significant life event that has the potential to foster authentic leadership, so this study provides an original contribution to the literature on strategies for intra-personal leadership development;</p> <p>-The study corroborates the assertion that many individuals have the potential to become authentic leaders, provided that the skills identified for development and the techniques are chosen to develop them are appropriate, such as being immersed in a world wilderness, coping with challenges, engaging with peer-to-peer conversations promoting co-development of insights and reflection;</p> <p>-The study suggests that that wilderness experiences can also nurture changes into leadership styles that are more beneficial to society at large, extending the literature on the positive effects of nature experiences;</p>	<p>programs. Yet, and having in consideration the limitations, the attributes of the transformation, the program can probably be flexibly adopted and implemented in other leadership transformation programs as well;</p>
Model: Servant Leadership			
Reference	Limitations	Implications	Future Suggestions
Taylor, Martin, Hutchinson & Jinks, 2007	- Due to the small sample size of school leaders, the findings cannot be generalized to the total population of school	-The better a principal understands teachers' expectations, the more likely it is that a principal can fulfil the	-The critical importance of effective leadership, as well as the implementation of the principles of servant

	<p>leaders;</p> <p>-The leadership characteristics measured are representative of more individuals in the profession of education than business managers;</p>	<p>expectations of the role;</p> <p>- Servant leaders lead by example and thus enable others to lead;</p> <p>-By understanding their purpose as a leader, the servant leader can guide others through appropriate modelling towards that shared vision;</p> <p>-The data provided by this inquiry can also be used as a justification for additional inquiries on the servant style of leadership;</p> <p>-Valid and reliable data on teacher expectations will assist principals to understand more thoroughly how those expectations can influence teacher behavior, which could ultimately affect student achievement;</p> <p>-The leader who embraces their role as servant leader may create schools in which commitment to self and others are the daily practice of leaders throughout and in turn, will transform their followers as well as the organization;</p>	<p>leadership into the daily leadership practices of public-school principals, should be taken into consideration to further research;</p> <p>-Educational leadership programs should be adapted to include the study and practical application of the principles and practices of servant leadership;</p> <p>-Utilizing the five best leadership practices as a framework, higher education preparatory programs should integrate servant leadership characteristics and practices into leadership and teacher curricula;</p> <p>-Educational institutions should take steps to enhance educational leaders' skills in modelling, enabling and encouraging their followers;</p> <p>-By incorporating readings, discussions, and activities on collaboration and servant and distributed leadership into leadership preparatory programs, aspiring leaders will be allowed to understand how those theories and processes can encourage and enable all participants to be viable members of the organization;</p> <p>-Educational preparatory programs should establish and promote an</p>
--	---	--	--

			<p>exemplary standard of excellence, in both performance and in the treatment of others;</p> <p>-Educational institutions should attempt to foster collaboration by striving to create an atmosphere of trust, using student empowerment activities and problem-based projects;</p> <p>-Servant leadership should be the focus of in-service training for another practicing educational personnel;</p> <p>-This caring style of leadership should also be nurtured and cultivated in every classroom as well;</p>
<p><i>Ebener & O'Connell, 2010</i></p>	<p>-This study incorporated the results of only three Catholic parishes in southeast Iowa, therefore, this study was unable to test other possibilities such as other denominations or religions, nonreligious groups, non-membership organizations, or other geographical areas;</p> <p>-The capacity of the study did not allow for the inclusion of low-performing or average performing parishes to distinguish what other factors might make a parish successful;</p> <p>- The issues addressed, such as how leadership works and why it affects organizational performance, receive too little attention and the</p>	<p>-This study contributes to understanding leader-member dynamics;</p> <p>-Once a leader embraces that approach (and uses the invitation, inspiration, and affection) the leader will change the organizational culture and structure;</p> <p>- If servant leadership does enhance organizational citizenship and if organizational citizenship does enhance organizational performance, then can be argued that servant leadership enhances organizational performance;</p> <p>- The means toward realizing high performance in a</p>	<p>-More research is needed to generalize this study beyond its limitations and to test this model of servant leadership more broadly, seeking to confirm the proposed linkages of servant leadership and organizational citizenship in a variety of settings, which will allow the growth and nurture of the effectiveness of leaders and their organizations;</p> <p>-If leaders place themselves in humble service to their organization, recognize the talents of others, and call them forth through empowering actions, then the people will respond with organizational</p>

	<p>training provided for nonprofit managers and leaders is inadequate to the challenges that they will face;</p> <p>-Many nonprofit organizations, including the Catholic church, are hierarchical organizations where the power distance between those in management and those on the front lines is not conducive to the elements of servant leadership discussed;</p>	<p>congregation include very specific behaviors that can increase the effectiveness of parish leaders, regardless of their area of ministry;</p>	<p>citizenship behaviors by helping each other, taking initiative, participating in various activities, and taking responsibility to continuously develop themselves as potential leaders of their organizations;</p>
Massey, Sulak & Sriram, 2013	<p>-The data for the current study was collected through self-report which may lead to an inaccurate measure of students' development in leadership skills;</p> <p>-The students in the current study tended to score at the strongly agree end of the spectrum and, as such, may be less likely to accurately report leadership gains;</p> <p>-Due to attrition the number of students participating in the baseline was much higher than the number of students completing the final iteration, it was difficult to interpret the results;</p> <p>-As the focus of the program shifted from student leaders to the students being served, the leadership development of those involved flattened out;</p>	<p>-This study provides useful insight into the application of Kolb's model to servant leadership development;</p> <p>-As the research examining pedagogies that facilitate student leadership development continues to grow, the extent to which experiential learning contributes to leadership development will become more evident;</p>	<p>-Further research examining student leadership development through experiential learning would benefit from using Kolb's model as an assessment framework;</p> <p>-Leadership development programs that employ experiential approaches to learning should include more formalized connections between theory and practice;</p> <p>-Incorporating intentional reflection into the learning cycle should significantly improve leadership development on college campuses;</p>
Stewart, 2014	<p>-Service-learners in this study were junior-level</p>	<p>-It may be more likely that wisdom is more</p>	<p>-These experiences established as a new</p>

	<p>under graduates, who had declared education as their major the previous semester, and even though some students were non-traditional students, students were still relatively young, and so the issue of maturity and stage of development does give the authors a reason to pause when trying to interpret the wisdom findings, complementary to developmental stage is the social climate in which students live and are raised Millennial;</p> <p>-Service-learners in this study were volunteering with students with varying disabilities and compartmentalizing students with disabilities is unrealistic, so service-learners answering that they are unable to foresee future events might be evidence of greater learning in these settings;</p> <p>-As they do not have a future setting on which to apply these experiences yet, this limits the application of any noted variables or issues in a classroom to an abstract future or space;</p>	<p>likely to correlate with time spent in a specific environment;</p> <p>-It may be argued that significant over-time changes are not necessary or even expected on each subscale of the SLQ;</p> <p>-Despite service-learners increase on each measure, and significantly on all but two subscales, an 'awakening may be necessary for an individual to learn to be a servant leader;</p> <p>-Service-learning, when conceptualized like the treatment may serve as the transformative experience necessary to address different aspects of servant leadership and teacher efficacy individually or simultaneously;</p>	<p>frame of reference or as a new mental model, or exploring an existing schema on which future experiences and identities may be built;</p> <p>-Not everyone is a servant leader as it relies on a commensurate value system, therefore it should not be expected significant outcomes across them;</p>
Fields, Thompson & Hawkins, 2015	Not Available	<p>-The results support embedding servant leadership instruction within undergraduate capstone curricula for the helping professions;</p> <p>-Even students who are predisposed to valuing</p>	<p>-Good assessment, diagnostic, and prognostic case work will enable a sense of the unknown to clients and foresee possibilities that they may be unable to foresee;</p>

		<p>the “other,” such as those in the helping professions, can benefit from underpinning professional training with servant leadership principles;</p> <p>-Analyzing patterns of human interaction is a basic skill for the student in the helping professions;</p> <p>-Servant leadership principles are in concert with ethical codes that guide helping professionals, which calls for the ability to understand the limitations of practice that permit withdrawal and an emphasis on the interest of others over self;</p> <p>-Helping professionals are also expected to be transparent, working without deception or hidden motives, exemplifying professional integrity that is reflective of open, participatory leadership;</p> <p>-The shift in responsibility helps the emerging professional depend on their developing vision for others and their communities;</p> <p>-While challenging to learn and practice, the concept of hope makes servant leadership ideal for the helping professional, therefore social workers,</p>	
--	--	--	--

		psychologists, family therapists, and behavior scientists have no basis for exercising the skills and attitudes central to professional practice without it;	
Winston & Fields, 2014	<p>-Data used in this study was collected using a single voluntarily questionnaire, so it is possible that the relationships among the key variables were inflated by common method variance;</p> <p>- In the sample there were no significant differences in the levels of servant leader behaviors and the levels of leader effectiveness reported by respondents across six major industry categories;</p> <p>-The sample used in this study was dominated by experienced workers, so it is possible that less experienced employees will view the other behaviors as more important to their success and the respondent perceptions of these leaders could be confounded with general “halo” perceptions of a leader;</p> <p>- This study did not consider the context within which leader-follower relationships are established and implemented;</p> <p>.</p>	<p>-The study provides a psychometrically valid approach to measure the extent to which an individual leader exhibits behavior establishing servant leadership, this will be useful for the 360-degree assessments, frequently used in contemporary leadership development efforts;</p> <p>-Contextual variables may moderate the effects of servant leader core behaviors and possibly impact the reciprocity that is an essential ingredient to the formation process for servant leadership;</p> <p>-Increased organizational interest in the development of servant leaders reflects a realization that employee development and success due to better performance is a way that organizations can effectively leverage investments in leadership development;</p>	<p>-Future studies should examine servant leadership longitudinally and test and investigate the model of the loci and transmitting mechanisms for servant leadership;</p> <p>-By understanding how leaders make attributions about how followers influence their choice of the core servant leader behaviors, it would originate a deeper understanding of the servant leadership process;</p> <p>-In the case of a non-traditional approach such as servant leadership, the process of social contagion deserves further explication and investigation;</p> <p>-Qualitative studies may be needed to understand why this present study found a negative correlation between the Essential Servant Leadership Behaviors and Inspirational Motivation from Transformational Leadership;</p> <p>-Future evaluation efforts should examine the unique contribution of the new servant leadership measure to the explanation of the</p>

			variance in judgments of leader effectiveness and in employee outcomes;
Modell: Ethical Leadership			
Reference	Limitations	Implications	Future Suggestions
Kvalnes & Øverenget, 2012	-The approach does not directly develop the non-cognitive skills required to identify and respond to the dilemma;	-Ethics education can serve to clothe unethical practices with ethical concepts and virtues; - Ethical theory can play a part in handling and analyzing dilemmas and other challenging situations. - Ethical training in business can be exploited wrongly, but on the other hand, there is plenty of sincere and systematic activity in business to address the issues and make people more competent in dealing with their challenges;	-Empirically oriented research should be developed to establish the extent to which this version of dilemma training actually is an effective way of learning practical ethics; -Dilemma training and other workshop methods can be used to explore the different dimensions of such situations and to prepare people for them; -Individuals and organizations committed to developing their responsiveness to ethical and moral challenges need to address both cognitive and non-cognitive attributes; -The sensitivity to moral aspects of a situation can be brought up as a topic in workshops and seminars, but it can probably be most effectively addressed in the workplace and in concrete settings; -The crucial role of business leaders and managers as role models in such situations should be explored;
Gentile,2015	Not Available	-Although Giving Voice to Values (GVV) was developed as a pedagogical methodology for integrating values and ethics into the	Not Available

		<p>curriculum itself, particularly in business education, it has now been expanded, adapted, and used in many other settings;</p> <p>-Giving Voice to Values is both its basis in experience and scholarship, it is simple and accessible, yet powerful as a methodology for developing and enabling values-driven leadership at all levels;</p>	
Ullah, Rehman, Hameed & Kayani, 2017	<p>-The research used a cross-sectional assessment for data collection and focused only on limited outcomes;</p> <p>-The sample of this research was the manufacturing organizations which does not allow generalizability to other circumstances;</p> <p>-This study was executed in Pakistan, which does not allow the generalization of this framework;</p>	<p>-It is encouraging to forecast that the visibility of the relation between ethical leadership and intellectual capital would progressively increase as organizations originate for monitoring the development of their human and social capital and relate their business ethics with their developments;</p> <p>-Business managers can demonstrate their employees, clients, and stakeholders that, through stimulating morality and ethics, they not only take accountabilities towards their associated stakeholders but also improve human and social capital for better performance and competitiveness;</p> <p>-The optimistic influence of ethical leadership and ethical</p>	<p>-Future studies might use longitudinal survey and requests a multicultural investigation for observing the generalization of this framework;</p> <p>-It will be imperative to inflate the nomological network of likely dependent variables by considering positive outcomes of ethical leadership;</p> <p>-Instead of an only focus on physical assets and short-term economic performance, care must also be given to increase the responsiveness of the significance of intellectual capital that could affect the long-term viability of the firm;</p> <p>-Transparency of each intellectual capital, which is human and social capital, can be improved to permit their examination and development by</p>

		<p>climate of the business, are very effective for corporate leaders, consequently, businesses must pay supplementary consideration to such leaders and inspire them to employ ethical leadership meant for stimulating the moral culture and CSR;</p> <p>- By checking the relationship of ethical leadership and CSR with variables such as organizational culture, human capital, and social capital provides a foundation for future study and a deeper understanding of the fundamental progressions, which stimulate and improve corporate social responsibility;</p>	<p>selecting suitable signals;</p>
Mostaza, Narbarte, Gayoba, Borromeo & Balila, 2018	Not Available	<p>-The administrators are highly religious because they involved themselves in and practice the basic spiritual disciplines of prayer, repentance, worship, Bible study, meditation, prophetic critiquing, evangelism, fellowship, stewardship, and service;</p> <p>-As to their personality traits, they are highly open to experience, conscientious, extravert, agreeable and moderately neurotic;</p> <p>-As leaders, the administrators are highly ethical because</p>	<p>-A leadership behavioral enhancement seminar should be included in the annual spiritual development plan of the institutions, with the objective of educating future leaders to stay calm, emotionally stable, and free from persistent negative feelings as they face various challenges in the workplace;</p> <p>-The religiosity and personality traits of the potential candidates for a leadership position must be assessed and be used as a basis for hiring;</p> <p>-Further research must be conducted using</p>

		<p>they demonstrate ethical conduct in their personal lives and professional dealings and promote to their people ethical behavior;</p> <p>-There is a significant relationship between religiosity and personality traits and also between personality traits and ethical leadership;</p> <p>-There is also a significant positive relationship between religiosity and ethical leadership;</p> <p>-Among the five traits of personality, agreeableness, openness to experience, and conscientiousness predict ethical leadership;</p>	<p>leaders from non-Christian institutions to determine the incidence of ethical behavior in the workplace and the associated factors;</p>
--	--	---	--

Considering the limitations, the most mentioned is the sample size. Authors claim the need for larger samples for allowing the generalizability of the results. Another conclusion to be drawn from the analysis is that small group coaching is not a suitable method for the development of everyone, which means it is not suitable for particular individuals. Still, within the methods, self-reports are subjective, and it may lead to an inaccurate measure of individual development in leadership skills. It is still important to refer that leadership educator is faced with different dynamics and even changing variables within practical leadership. To finish, another conclusion transverse to all studies is that more research is needed to corroborate the results of the different studies.

Concerning the implications, in general, the results can be transferable to other contexts (such as learning contexts or organizational contexts) and many of them are pioneers or the first to demonstrate a certain result. The results achieved by Baron (2016) demonstrate firstly that participation in a program of leadership development was associated with mindfulness and that a leadership development program based on

action learning principles can foster the development of Authentic Leadership and mindfulness. It is also relevant to consider the implications related to the Van Droffelaar & Jacobs (2017) study, highlighting the attributes of the transformation program that foster change can be flexibly adopted and implemented in a wide range of leadership transformation programs. Being immersed in nature can act as a significant life event that has the potential to foster authentic leadership, providing an original contribution to the literature on strategies for intra-personal leadership development. The study also corroborates the assertion that many individuals have the potential to become authentic leaders, provided that the skills identified for development and the techniques are chosen to develop them are appropriate, such as coping with challenges for which different knowledge and skills are needed, engaging with peer-to-peer conversations promoting co-development of insights and reflection (Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017).

Regarding authentic leadership, it is implied its potential efficacy of group coaching and its ability to help participants develop as authentic leaders represent a significant contribution to coaching science and leadership coaching practice (Fusco et al., 2016). By including measures of moral reasoning, moral motivation and psychological hardiness the importance of nurturing mature moral reasoning and an internalized moral motivation is highlighted, which could represent a productive perspective in recruitment and selection processes, as part of the development of Authentic Leadership (Olsen & Espevik, 2017). The studies also imply that authentic leaders exhibit high levels of self-awareness, as well as high levels of internalized moral perspective, relational transparency, and balanced processing of information, indicating that authentic leaders will potentially place organizational and followers' needs above their own needs and will pursue ethical practices that will benefit learning (Opatokun et al., 2013).

About Servant leadership, principles are in concert with ethical codes that guide helping professionals, which calls for the ability to understand the limitations of practice that permit withdrawal and an emphasis on the interest of others over self hence helping professionals are also expected to be transparent, working without deception or hidden motives, exemplifying professional integrity that is reflective of open, participatory leadership (Fields et al., 2015). Servant leaders can guide others through appropriate modelling towards that shared vision and therefore transform the followers as well as

the organization (Taylor et al., 2007). Increased organizational interest in the development of servant leaders reflects the realization that employee development and success due to better performance is a way that organizations can effectively leverage investments in leadership development, hence Servant leadership enhances organizational performance (Winston & Fields, 2014; *Ebener & O'Connell, 2010*). It should also be detached the fact that the visibility of the relation between ethical leadership and intellectual capital would progressively increase as organizations originate for monitoring the development of their human and social capital and relate their business ethics with their developments. The optimistic influence of ethical leadership and ethical climate of the business are very effective for corporate leaders, consequently, businesses must pay supplementary consideration to such leaders and inspire them to employ ethical leadership meant for stimulating the moral culture and corporate social responsibility (Ullah et al., 2017).

To conclude and regarding the authors' suggestions, more research is needed to generalize the results of the studies beyond its limitations and to explore these objectively. Instrument development and the accompanying exploration of generalizability of the innovative methods to leadership learning contexts should be inserted in future research (Winston & Fields, 2014). Future studies should examine the different types of leadership longitudinally. Accordingly, servant leadership might explore and test longitudinally the transmission of mechanisms for servant leadership (Winston & Fields, 2014). Leadership development programs that employ experiential approaches to learning should include more established connections between theory and practice (Massey, Sulak & Sriram, 2013). There is a need to have leaders that are authentic in their dealings and disposition and so normative approaches to authentic leadership will need to find a way in which leaders and staff work together to share leadership in an aligned way (Opatokun et al., 2013). The critical importance of effective leadership, as well as the implementation of the principles of Educational leadership programs, should be adapted to include the study and practical application of the principles and practices of servant leadership. Educational institutions should also take steps to enhance educational leaders' skills in modelling, enabling and encouraging their followers (Taylor et al., 2007). Besides that, future evaluation efforts should examine the unique contribution of the new servant leadership measure in order to

explain the variance in the judgments of leader effectiveness and in employee outcomes (Winston & Fields, 2014).

Discussion

It is observed that the most frequent model in the literature is the Authentic leadership model, corresponding to the largest number of articles included in this literature review. It is interesting that although the notion of authenticity has been around for centuries, the concept of Authentic leadership appeared in the literature only in 2000, with the rise of the positive psychology movement. Authentic Leadership is increasingly emerging as an integrative concept in the literature on positive organizational behavior, ethical leadership, and transformational leadership, which may justify the fact that the Authentic leadership model is the most recurrent in the literature. Papers from academic journals and the popular press have contributed to a progressive clarification of what it means to be “an authentic leader” (Baron, 2016). However, due to the interdisciplinary nature of leadership, since 2004, research on servant leadership has increasingly been published in high impact factor journals, including *Academy of Management Journal* and *The Leadership Quarterly*. Further, top-tier hospitality journals have also published multiple works on servant leadership. While the majority has been conducted in the organizational psychology discipline, servant leadership has emerged in other disciplines, such as in healthcare, education, and hospitality (Eva et al., 2018).

It was also verified that most of the interventions analyzed were undertaken in the USA. However, this kind of interventions is already being conducted in Europe in countries like the UK, Norway and in the Netherlands. Most of the samples used in the interventions rely on students. This can be justified by the fact that there is easier access to them and because they are involved in the educational process. Taking into account the years of experience, it has been observed that the experience of participants in the various interventions ranges from five years to thirty-one years. But in most articles, it does not exceed fifteen years of experience.

Regarding gender issues, which are currently an increasingly relevant subject, it has been observed that in some cases it is still verified that the number of male participants is much higher than the number of female participants. However, given the

available data, it is already clear that the number of female participants starts to equal or even surpass the number of male participants. Increasingly, and with the advent of feminist movements in recent years, it can be expected that in the future the number of female participants will increase and that it will equal the percentage of male participants. Another relevant factor is also that there are more women than men attending college, and since many of the study samples rely on students, this can then influence the percentage of female participants available for future studies.

Regarding the approaches that generate the development of Authentic leadership, the concepts of self-awareness, internalized moral perspective and relational transparency stand out since they can generate authentic leadership and leadership development (Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017; Fusco et al., 2016). These concepts might also be useful for administrative and educators, hence as results suggest, when administrative heads hold high levels of self-awareness, they may be much more likely to develop the authenticity of their colleagues in efforts to improve higher learning and it also supports the notion that internalized moral perspective is a required component of authentic leadership (Opatokun et al., 2013). Measures of moral reasoning, moral motivation, and psychological hardiness could represent a creative perspective in recruitment and selection processes, as part of the development of Authentic Leadership (Olsen & Espevik, 2017). It should also be noted that contact with nature enhances authentic leadership (Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017).

Mindfulness was positively associated with authentic leadership, and as mentioned previously, leadership development program based on action learning principles can foster the development of Authentic Leadership and mindfulness (Fusco et al., 2016). Also, coaching groups have proven to be an effective form of helping participants to develop as authentic leaders (Fusco, O’Riordan & Palmer, 2016).

Literature proves that there is a similarity between coaching and other structured actions of intentional development, like mentoring and supervision. The perceived benefits of coaching supervision outputs are related to professional development, both regarding professional identity and competence development, and also to support function, which is related to self-management, internal management, self-knowledge, self-awareness development, the improvement of interaction and cooperation skills, and coping better at work. Nowadays, other professional areas than helping professions are

finding supervision a worthwhile developmental practice. About mentoring, there are three distinct areas of mentoring: youth, academic, and workplace in different developmental phases. In organizational settings, mentoring is oriented to help the protégé develop personally and professionally, supported the mentor, but mentors can also benefit from these relationships. Technology, more specifically electronic mentoring (or e-mentoring), offers new learning as well as career and emotional support, which helps organizations directly by maintaining skilled employees and an internal culture and improves the fit between managers and organizations (Dos Santos & Pais, 2015). To conclude, since mentoring and supervision have similarities with coaching, and coaching have proven to be helpful for individuals to develop as authentic leaders, in the future it might be interesting to explore the relationship they have with the various leadership models addressed throughout the article, especially with authentic leadership.

According to the theory, Authentic leaders will place organizational and followers' needs above their own needs, apply a positive moral perspective to lead by example and will pursue ethical practices that will benefit learning (Opatokun et al., 2013; Gardner et al., 2005). Coping with challenges for which different knowledge and skills are needed, engaging with peer-to-peer conversations promoting co-development of insights and reflection can help individuals to become authentic leaders (Van Droffelaar & Jacobs, 2017).

Regarding Ethical leadership, the leadership of any organization is based on the character of the individuals running it (Mostaza et al., 2018). It should be highlighted the influence of ethical leadership and ethical climate of the business which are very effective for corporate leaders (Ullah et al., 2017). Dilemma training sessions have proved effective. It helps to recognize the ethical dimensions of leadership and The Navigation Wheel turned out to be an efficient tool. There is a strong correlation between personality traits and ethical leadership (Kvalnes & Øverenget, 2012; Mostaza et al., 2018).

Leaders influence the behaviors of followers. The leader's conduct is seen through the outward behaviors, while the character is manifested by virtuous living, personal training and self-discipline, which indicates that the leader is not born with character,

instead it is established through the routines and practices of the person being trained (Ebener & O'Connell, 2010).

Servant-leaders respect and involve their followers in decision making and planning, transforming the followers and the organization (Taylor et al., 2007; Yiğit & Bozkurt, 2017). Greenleaf defined ten characteristics of servant leaders and within these, there are three that stand out particularly, such as awareness, commitment to the growth of others and building community (Fields et al., 2015). Servant leadership principles are in concert with ethical codes and internalizing traits of servant leaders is useful in helping professions, which calls for the interest of others over self, originates an increased awareness of responsibility and helps build strong relationships with the community (Fields et al., 2015). Employee development and success allows organizations to effectively leverage investments in leadership development (Winston & Fields, 2014; Ebener & O'Connell, 2010).

In order to strengthen the analysis, it is relevant to take into account the mentioned gaps found transversely in the studies included in this literature review and also suggestions to bridge these gaps, which is mentioned in Table 4.

Table 4. Gaps and suggestions

Gaps	Assumptions	Suggestions
Using mainly surveys and questionnaires to evaluate leadership in organizations	Low accuracy of the measures	To use measures closer to the actual exercise of leadership and diversification of measures
Most of the samples are students	Students don't represent the typical leader	Future studies should focus on leaders and people performing leadership roles
Low number of studies	Diversity of contexts enriches the understanding of phenomena; High number of studies help in confirming the results and in interpreting them	Increasing the number of studies in diverse contexts

This review has some associated limitations. First, publication bias was not addressed in the present study and this article did not take into account the literature

published in languages other than English, since this was an inclusion criterion. Additionally, this review did not consider studies that have been published in databases other than those mentioned previously in the method section.

The studies examined reinforce the idea that positive leadership, in its models, is susceptible to being developed. Summarily, and regarding the Servant Leadership model, from the ten characteristics of servant leaders defined by Greenleaf three stand out (awareness, commitment to the growth of others and building community). Regarding the Authentic Leadership mode, it is noteworthy the concepts of self-awareness, internalized moral perspective and relational transparency; and, finally, considering the Ethical Leadership model, it should be mentioned and highlighted the strong correlation between personality traits and ethical leadership and the influence of ethical leadership and ethical climate of the business for corporate leaders. It is also relevant to mention that a leader is not born with character, instead, it is established over time through the routines and practices. The designs that proved to be most effective were coaching groups, training programs and the use of dilemmas. Mindfulness and contact with nature have also proved promising for future studies. In practice, it is expected that this article will have an impact helping Human Resources Departments put these ideas into practice, and future studies can focus on interventions and dimensions that were revealed in this study to be more effective and with greater development potential.

References:

- Avolio, B. J., & Gardner, W. L. (2005). Authentic leadership development: Getting to the root of positive forms of leadership. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 16, 315–338.
- Baron, L. (2016). Authentic leadership and mindfulness development through action learning. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 31(1), 296.
- Bauman, D. C. (2018). Plato on Virtuous Leadership: An Ancient Model for Modern Business. *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 28(3), 251–274.
- Caldwell, C., Hasan, Z., & Smith, S. (2015). Virtuous leadership – insights for the 21st century. *Journal of Management Development*, 34(9), 1181.
- Dos Santos, N. R. & Pais, L. (2015). Structured actions of intentional development. In K. Kraiger, J. Passmore, N. R dos Santos & S. Malvezzi (Eds), *The Wiley-Blackwell Handbook of the Psychology of Training, Development, and Performance Improvement* (398-418). UK, Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley Blackwell.
- Ebener, D. R., & O'Connell, D. J. (2010). How might servant leadership work? *Nonprofit Management & Leadership*, 20(3), 315–335.
- Eva, N., Robin, M., Sendjaya, S., van Dierendonck, D., & Liden, R. C. (2018). Servant Leadership: A systematic review and call for future research. *The Leadership Quarterly*.
- Evans, L., Hess, C. A., Abdelhamid, S., & Stepleman, L. M. (2016). Leadership Development in the Context of a University Consolidation: An Initial Evaluation of the Authentic Leadership Pipeline Program. *Journal of Leadership Studies*, 10(3), 7–21.
- Fields, J. W., Thompson, K. C., & Hawkins, J. R. (2015). Servant Leadership: Teaching the Helping Professional. *Journal of Leadership Education*, 14(4), 92.
- Fusco, T., O'Riordan, S., & Palmer, S. (2015). Authentic Leaders are... Conscious, Competent, Confident, and Congruent: A Grounded Theory of Group Coaching and Authentic Leadership Development. *International Coaching Psychology Review*, 10(2), 131–148.
- Fusco, T., O'Riordan, S., & Palmer, S. (2016). Assessing the efficacy of Authentic Leadership group-coaching. *International Coaching Psychology Review*, 11(2), 118–128.
- Gardner, W. L., Avolio, B. J., Luthans, F., May, D. R., & Walumbwa, F. (2005). “Can you see the real me?” A self-based model of authentic leader and follower development. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 16, 343–372.

- Gentile, M. C. (2015). Learning About Ethical Leadership Through the Giving Voice to Values Curriculum. *New Directions for Student Leadership*, 2015(146), 35–47.
- Greenier, V. T., & Whitehead, G. E. K. (2016). Towards a Model of Teacher Leadership in ELT: Authentic Leadership in Classroom Practice. *RELC Journal*, 47(1), 79.
- Kvalnes, Ø., & Øverenget, E. (2012). Ethical Navigation in Leadership Training. *Nordic Journal of Applied Ethics / Etikk i Praksis*, 6(1), 58–71.
- Massey, J., Sulak, T., & Sriram, R. (2013). Influences of Theory and Practice in the Development of Servant Leadership in Students. *Journal of Leadership Education*, 12(1), 74.
- Mostaza, L. T., Narbarte, R. E., Gayoba, F. D., Borromeo, R., & Balila, J. S. (2018). Mediating Effect of Personality Traits on Religiosity and Ethical Leadership: Basis for a Leadership Development Program. *Catalyst*, 17, 6–16.
- Olsen, O. K., & Espevik, R. (2017). Moral antecedents of authentic leadership: Do moral justice reasoning, self-importance of moral identity and psychological hardiness stimulate authentic leadership? *Cogent Psychology*, 4(1), N.PAG.
- Opatokun, K. A., Hasim, C. N., & Syed Hassan, S. S. (2013). Authentic Leadership in Higher Learning Institution: A Case Study of International Islamic University Malaysia (Iium). *International Journal of Leadership Studies*, 8(1), 49–66.
- Parris, D., & Peachey, J. (2013). A Systematic Literature Review of Servant Leadership Theory in Organizational Contexts. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 113(3), 377–393.
- Pfeiffer, S. I., & Wechsler, S. M. (2013). Youth leadership: a proposal for identifying and developing creativity and giftedness. *Estudos de Psicologia (Campinas)*, 30(2), 219–229.
- Rachmawati, A. W., & Lantu, D. C. (2014). Servant Leadership Theory Development & Measurement. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 115, 387–393.
- Rasera, E. F., Oliveira, F. M., & Jesus, M. J. (2014). A prática grupal e o discurso sobre a ética em documentos oficiais. *Estudos de Psicologia (Campinas)*, 31(3), 405–414.
- Stewart, T. (2012). Classroom teacher leadership: service-learning for teacher sense of efficacy and servant leadership development. *School Leadership & Management*, 32(3), 233.
- Taylor, T., Martin, B. N., Hutchinson, S., & Jinks, M. (2007). Examination of leadership practices of principals identified as servant leaders. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 10(4), 401.
- Ullah, I., Rehman, K. U., Hameed, R. M., & Kayani, N. Z. (2017). Development of CSR through Ethical Leadership: Constructive Role of Ethical Culture and

- Intellectual Capital. *Pakistan Journal of Commerce & Social Sciences*, 11(3), 977–1004.
- Van Droffelaar, B., & Jacobs, M. (2017). The role of wilderness experiences in leaders' development toward authentic leadership. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal*, 38(8), 1144.
- Winston, B., & Fields, D. (2015). Seeking and measuring the essential behaviors of servant leadership. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal*, 36(4), 413.
- Yiğit, B., & Bozkurt, S. (2017). A content analysis of servant leadership studies. *International Journal of Organizational Leadership*, 6(2), 190–196.